Decoding long-term trends in the wet deposition of sulfate, nitrate and ammonium after reducing the perturbation from climate anomalies

Xiaohong Yao¹, Leiming Zhang²

¹Key Lab of Marine Environmental Science and Ecology, Ocean University of China, Qingdao 266100, China
²Air Quality Research Division, Science and Technology Branch, Environment and Climate Change Canada, Toronto, Canada

Correspondence to: X. Yao (xhyao@ouc.edu.cn) and L. Zhang (leiming.zhang@canada.ca)
Abstract. Long-term trends of wet deposition of inorganic ions are affected by multiple factors, among which emission changes and climate conditions are dominant ones. To assess the effectiveness of emission reductions on the wet deposition of pollutants of interest, contributions from these factors to the long-term trends of wet deposition must be isolated. For this purpose, a two-step approach for preprocessing wet deposition data is presented herein. This new approach aims to reduce the impact of climate anomalies on the trend analysis so that the impact of emission reductions on the wet deposition can be revealed. This approach is applied to a two-decade wet deposition dataset of sulfate (SO$_4^{2-}$), nitrate (NO$_3^-$) and ammonium (NH$_4^+$) at rural Canadian sites. Analysis results show that the approach allows for robustly identifying inflection points on decreasing trends in the wet deposition fluxes of SO$_4^{2-}$ and NO$_3^-$ in northern Ontario and Québec. The inflection points match well with the three-phase mitigation of SO$_2$ emissions and two-phase mitigation of NOx emissions in Ontario. Improved correlations between the wet deposition of ions and their precursors’ emissions were obtained after reducing the impact from climate anomalies. Furthermore, decadal climate anomalies were identified as dominating the decreasing trends in the wet deposition fluxes of SO$_4^{2-}$ and NO$_3^-$ at a western coastal site. Long-term variations in NH$_4^+$ wet deposition showed no clear trends due to the compensating effects between NH$_3$ emissions, climate anomalies, and chemistry associated with the emission changes of sulfur and nitrogen.

1. Introduction

To assess the long-term impacts of acidifying pollutants on the environment, the wet deposition of sulfate (SO$_4^{2-}$), nitrate (NO$_3^-$) and ammonium (NH$_4^+$), among other inorganic ions, has been measured for several decades through monitoring networks
such as the European Monitoring and Evaluation Programme (EMEP) (Fowler et al., 2005, 2007; Rogora et al., 2004, 2016), the National Atmospheric Deposition Program/National Trends Network in the U.S. (Baumgardner et al., 2002; Lehmann et al., 2007; Sickles & Shadwick, 2015), and the Canadian Air and Precipitation Monitoring Network (CAPMoN) (Vet et al., 2014; Zbieranowski and Aherne, 2011). The high-quality data collected from these networks have been widely used to quantify the atmospheric deposition of acidifying pollutants (Lajtha & Jones, 2013; Lynch et al., 2000; Pihl Karlsson et al., 2011; Strock et al., 2014; Vet et al., 2014). The data have also been utilized to identify trends in the atmospheric deposition of reactive nitrogen (Fagerli & Aas, 2008; Fowler et al., 2007; Lehmann et al., 2007; Zbieranowski and Aherne, 2011) and to examine the impacts of acid rain and the perturbation of the natural nitrogen cycle on sensitive ecosystems (Wright et al., 2018). The long-term data can also be used for assessing the effectiveness of environmental policies (Butler et al., 2005; Li et al., 2016; Lloret & Valiela, 2016).

The wet deposition of SO$_4^{2-}$, NO$_3^-$ and NH$_4^+$ is affected by not only their gaseous precursors’ emissions (Butler et al., 2005; Fowler et al., 2007; Li et al., 2016) but also complex atmospheric processes (Cheng & Zhang, 2017; Yao & Zhang, 2012; Zhang et al., 2012). Those atmospheric processes sometimes lead to extremely high wet deposition fluxes of ions during a precipitation event or even throughout a particular month. Furthermore, climate anomalies can alter the relative contributions of local sources versus long-range transport to the total wet deposition amounts at reception sites, thereby complicating the relationships between wet deposition and the emission of air pollutants of interest (Lloret & Valiela, 2016; Monteith et al., 2016; Wetherbee & Mast, 2016). The emissions of SO$_2$ and NOx have been decreasing substantially in
Europe and North America (Butler et al., 2005; Li et al., 2016; Pihl Karlsson et al., 2011); coincidently, climate anomalies have also occurred more frequently in recent decades (Burakowski et al., 2008; Lloret & Valiela, 2016; Wijngaard et al., 2003), thereby leading to more complicated linkages between wet deposition and emission trends on decadal scales.

Many trend analysis studies in the literature simply examined annual or seasonal values as the data inputs for two popular trend analysis tools, i.e., the Mann-Kendall (M-K) and linear regression (LR) methods (Marchetto et al., 2013; Waldner et al., 2014 and references therein). These studies focused on the detection of statistically significant trends; for example, Waldner et al. (2014) conducted a comprehensive analysis on the applicability of the techniques to different choices of length and temporal resolutions of a data series. Regarding the resolved trend results, these approaches are not well suited to separating the impact of air pollutants’ mitigation from the perturbation by climate anomalies. Large uncertainties thus existed in the studies interpreting the major driving forces determining the extracted trends in the wet deposition of $\text{SO}_4^{2-}, \text{NO}_3^-$ and $\text{NH}_4^+$. Regarding that air pollutant’s emission mitigation targets often vary in different phases of the entire study period, inflection points may exist in the trends in the wet deposition of ions. The inflection points were rarely studied, despite their importance for assessing the effectiveness of environmental policies. An alternative would be to use high time resolution data in the Ensemble Empirical Mode Decomposition (EEMD) method (Wu & Huang, 2009); however, this method still suffers from the end effect in certain scenarios, whereby the extracted trends cannot be explained (Yao & Zhang, 2016).
A new approach is presented herein that aims to reduce the perturbations from climate anomalies on data inputs so that robust trends can be elucidated for evaluating the effectiveness of emission control policies. In this approach, raw data are preprocessed to generate a new variable, which is then applied to M-K and LR methods. A piecewise linear regression (PLR) is also used to extract trends for cases in presence of inflection points. The extracted trends in the wet deposition data on a decadal scale are then properly linked to major driving forces such as emission reductions and climate anomalies. This new approach is first applied to the wet deposition data of SO$_4^{2-}$, NO$_3^-$ and NH$_4^+$ in Canada, as an example to demonstrate its capability and advantages over the traditional approaches. The extracted trends in the wet deposition of ions are further studied through correlation analysis with known emission trends of their respective gaseous precursors (SO$_2$, NOx and NH$_3$) in Canada and the U.S. Major driving forces for the trends of ion wet deposition and how the wet deposition ions responded to their precursors’ emissions in Canada are then revealed.

2. Methodology

Wet deposition flux ($F_{\text{wet}}$) data were obtained from CAPMoN (https://www.canada.ca/en/environment-climate-change/services/air-pollution/monitoring-networks-data/canadian-air-precipitation.html). Data from four sites have been collected for over twenty years and were chosen herein to illustrate the novel trend analysis method (Table S1). Site 1 is an inland forest site at Chapais in Québec. Site 2 is situated in a coastal forest area at Saturna in British Columbia. Sites 3 and 4 are two inland forest sites at the Chalk River and at Algoma, respectively, in northern Ontario. Details on data sampling, chemical analysis and quality control can be found in previous studies (Cheng & Zhang, 2017; Vet & Ro, 2008; Vet et al., 2014).
The emissions data of gaseous precursors were downloaded from the Air Pollutant Emission Inventory (APEI, https://pollution-waste.canada.ca/air-emission-inventory/) in Canada and from the USEPA National Emissions Inventory (NEI, https://www.epa.gov/air-emissions-inventories/air-emissions-sources) in the U.S. These data were demarcated at a provincial level in Canada and at a state level in the U.S. Data for the years of 1990 to 2011, which correspond to the period of selected F\textsubscript{wet} data, were used in this study.

The M-K method is a popular nonparametric statistical procedure that can yield qualitative trend results, such as “an increasing/decreasing trend with a P value of <0.05,” “a probable increasing/decreasing trend with a P value of 0.05-0.1,” “a stable trend with a P value of >0.1, as well as a ratio of <1.0 between the standard deviation and the mean of the dataset,” and “a no trend for P>0.1 with all other conditions” (Kampata et al., 2008; Marchetto et al., 2013). The LR method has also been widely used to extract trends (Marchetto et al., 2013; Waldner et al., 2014). Zbieranowski and Aherne (2011) used LR to extract trends by separating different phases because of the presence of inflection points in the entire study period, and the approach is same as PLR (Vieth, 1989). In this study, the three methods were employed to compute the trends of ion wet deposition using software downloaded from https://www.gsi-net.com/en/software/free-software/gsi-mann-kendall-toolkit.html and Excel 2016, first using the annual F\textsubscript{wet} directly as input data, then using a modified input data set, as described below.

The modified input data set was produced in two steps. The first step was an effort to reduce the perturbation from the monthly climate anomalies to the input data. This was
done by creating a new variable that was defined as the slopes of the regression
equations of a series of study years against a climatology (base) year using monthly
F_{wet} data. Note that the monthly F_{wet} data were aggregated from daily raw data before
the regression analysis. To ensure the presence of enough data points in each regression
equation, the data corresponding to two-year periods (or 24 monthly F_{wet} values) were
grouped together, as detailed below. At a selected site and for a given chemical
component, monthly F_{wet} data were generated for the first two years and were grouped
together and rearranged from the smallest to the largest values to form an array of data
with 24 data points, i.e., A(i) with i=1 to 24. Repeating the above procedure for the
subsequent years using a two-year interval to eventually obtain a series of data arrays,
A(i) now becomes A(i, j) with i=1 to 24 and j=1 to N, where N is the total number of
data arrays. The climatology data array (CA(i)) was then defined as the average of all
of the arrays as follows:

\[ CA(i) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{j=1}^{N} A(i, j), \quad i = 1 \text{ to } 24. \]

LR with zero interception was applied for each individual data array against the
climatology data array. In cases where the maximum monthly deposition flux deviated
greatly from the general regression curve, the slopes (m-values) were calculated after
excluding the maximum monthly deposition flux, which is an approach that reduced
the perturbation to the m-values from the monthly scale climate anomalies. The second
step was to screen out the outliers in m-values, which reduced the perturbation to the
m-values from the annual-scale climate anomalies.

An analysis of Site 1 is used to illustrate the new approach and demonstrate its
advantages against the existing common approaches used in the literature. Twelve four-
year periods of data (1988-1989, 1990-1991, etc.) are available from this site. The regression of each data set against the climatology data set was first performed using all of the monthly values to obtain an m-value (the slope) (Fig. 1a-d). For eight out of the 12 data sets, the m-values were recalculated after excluding the maximum monthly value of F_wet, which appeared to be an apparent outlier of the linear regression. The R^2 values, which are conventionally used in LR, were then significantly increased for these eight sets, e.g., from the original values of 0.79-0.94 to the improved values of 0.92-0.98. To demonstrate that the excluded maximum value was an outlier, the case of the 1990-1991 data set was taken as an example. The new regression equation (y=1.47x, R^2=0.98, Fig. 1a) predicted a maximum value in the range of 330-368 mg m^{-2} month^{-1} using three times the standard deviation (±3 SD, 0.08) at a 99% confidence level. The actual observed maximum value of 532 mg m^{-2} month^{-1} was much larger than the upper range of the predicted value and was thus believed to be caused by monthly scale climate anomalies. The maximum value was treated as an outlier and excluded for analysis. Using the similar procedure, all outliers in this study were identified. The exclusion of the observed maximum value greatly reduced the perturbation of the short-term climate anomalies to the calculated m-value in this two-year period, i.e., the m-value decreased from 1.67 to 1.47, which in turn increased the relative contribution of the air pollutants’ emissions to the calculated m-value. In summary, this new approach meets the objective of identifying outlier data points by applying the criteria of being outside the boundaries of ±3 times the standard deviation of the general trend.

The revised m-values were further scrutinized by eliminating the outliers caused by the annual-scale climate anomalies. For example, the m-value of 1.31 in 1998-1999 greatly deviated from other m-values, narrowly oscillating approximately 0.96±0.07 (average
± 1 SD) during the period of 1994-2005, even with the ±3 SD being considered (Fig. 1a-d). Using the value of 0.96 as the reference, climate anomalies likely increased the $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $SO_4^{2-}$ by 37% in 1998-1999. The m-values were then calculated by shifting one year in time to 1997-1998 (1.07) and to 1999-2000 (1.24). The $F_{\text{wet}}$ in 1998 was less affected by climate anomalies than that in 1999. Thus, the m-value in 1997-1998 was within 0.96±0.21 (average ± 3 SD) and used to replace the m-value in 1998-1999 for the trend analysis. Similar to the first step discussed above, this approach meets the objective of identifying outlier m-values by applying the criteria of being outside the range of ±3 SD plus the average m-value during a decade or a longer period.

More justification of the new approach can be found in the Supporting Information, including Figs. S1-3, wherein the statistical comparison between this and other approaches was presented. Theoretically, the extracted trend using the data preprocessed with the new approach is determined by the local emissions of air pollutants, the regional transport of air pollutants, and a small portion of climate anomalies that are unable to be removed by the new approach. It is assumed that the extracted trend is less affected by microphysical/chemical processes, since two-year data were used together to calculate the m-value.

In theory, if the data from different sites in the same region are grouped together for trend analysis, the results may be better linked to the trends of the regional emissions of related air pollutants. In the following sections, trend analysis results from individual sites as well as those from grouped sites are discussed. Sites 1, 3 and 4 showed similar trends in the wet deposition of $SO_4^{2-}$ and $NO_3^-$, and these three sites were grouped together.
3. Results and discussion

3.1 Trends at Site 1 after reducing perturbations from climate anomalies

Trends in the m-values shown in Fig. 2 represent the trends after removing the perturbations from climate anomalies at Site 1 in northern Québec from 1988 to 2011. SO$_4^{2-}$ and NO$_3^-$ showed decreasing trends from a LR analysis, with $R^2$ values of 0.81 and 0.71, respectively, and P values <0.01. The decreasing trends were also confirmed by the M-K method analysis. NH$_4^+$ exhibited a stable trend from M-K analysis, as well as no significant trend with P value >0.05 from LR analysis.

The m-values of SO$_4^{2-}$ and NO$_3^-$ also allowed for the identification of trends in different phases. The inflection point for each phase is critical to a) link the annual F$_{wet}$ of ions and the emissions of the corresponding precursors and b) assess the effectiveness of environmental policies. For example, the trends in the m-values of SO$_4^{2-}$ can be clearly classified into three phases. The m-values oscillated approximately 1.38±0.08 during Phase 1 (1988 to 1993) and approximately 1.02±0.08 during Phase 2 (1994 to 2005), with a significant difference between the two phases under the t-test (P value <0.01), thereby implying an abrupt decrease of approximately 30% at the inflection point between the two phases. In contrast, the m-values linearly decreased by approximately 20% every two years, starting from the end of Phase 2 to Phase 3 (2006-2011). Again, a significant difference existed between Phase 2 and Phase 3 under the t-test (P value <0.01). Overall, PLR should be applied separately for the different phases in the presence of the inflection points, rather than LR for the entire period, and the result is presented as:

$$\left\{ \begin{array}{l}
m - value = 1.38, 1988 \leq x < 1994 \\
m - value = 1.02, 1994 \leq x \leq 2004 \\
m - value = -0.185 \left( \frac{x}{2} - 1001 \right) + 1.15, 2004 < x \leq 2010 
\end{array} \right.$$

https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-2019-418

Preprint. Discussion started: 25 June 2019
© Author(s) 2019. CC BY 4.0 License.
where \( x \) represent the calendar year from 1988 to 2010.

The trend in the m-values of NO\(_3^-\) can be classified into two phases, with the inflection point at 2003, according to the t-test result, i.e., the values oscillated approximately 1.09±0.09 during the period from 1988 to 2003 and then exhibited a significant decrease of approximately 50% overall afterwards, with P value <0.01. The PRL result is expressed as below:

\[
\begin{align*}
    m - value &= 1.09, 1988 \leq x < 2004 \\
    m - value &= -0.128 \times \left( \frac{x}{2} - 1001 \right) + 1.08, 2004 \leq x \leq 2010
\end{align*}
\]

The m-value of NO\(_3^-\) in 1998-1999 was approximately 30% larger than the mean value in 1988-2003 and exceeded the mean value plus 3 SD in 1998-2003, and thus was not included in the trend analysis. The sharp increase in F\(_{\text{wet}}\) of NO\(_3^-\) occurred mainly in 1999, which was probably caused by a large perturbation from climate anomalies. Moreover, the monthly F\(_{\text{wet}}\) values of NO\(_3^-\) in March, April, July and August 1999 were actually lower than the corresponding long-term averages in 1988-2003 (excluding 1999) (Fig. S4a). This outcome indicates that the large increase in annual F\(_{\text{wet}}\) of NO\(_3^-\) in 1999 was unlikely to have been determined by the emissions of its gaseous precursors. The same can be said for the large increase in F\(_{\text{wet}}\) of SO\(_4^{2-}\) in 1999 (Fig. 2a, S4b).

The trends in the m-value of SO\(_4^{2-}\) at Site 1 (Fig. 2a) were clearly different from those of the SO\(_2\) emissions in Québec (Fig. 2c) but matched well to those in Ontario (Fig. 2c), which is also supported by their Pearson correlation coefficients, e.g., no significant correlation \((r = 0.46\) and P value >0.05) for the former case and a good correlation \((r = 0.96\) and P value <0.01) for the latter case. Note that \( r \) instead of \( R^2 \) is conventionally
used in correlation analysis and is therefore used here. Zhang et al. (2008) reported that this remote area can receive the long-range transport of air pollutants from Ontario but that transport is less likely from the intensive emission sources in Québec.

The trends in NOx emissions during 1990-2003 had similar bell-shape patterns in Québec and Ontario, although with different magnitudes of emissions (Fig. 2f). A different trend pattern was seen for the m-value of NO$_3^-$ at Site 1 than for the abovementioned provincial emissions during the same period (Fig. 2d), and there was no significant correlation (r<0.41, with P value >0.05) between the m-value of NO$_3^-$ and the emissions of NOx in Québec or Ontario. Different results were found for the period of 2002-2011 than those of 1990-2003 discussed above. In 2002-2011, the m-value of NO$_3^-$ decreased by ~50% and the NOx emissions decreased by ~40% in Québec and Ontario; also, good correlations (r = 0.94-0.95 with P values <0.01) were observed between m-values and emissions. The contrasting results between the two different periods discussed above implied one possibility, i.e., that the perturbation from climate anomalies, which was unable to be removed by the new approach, overwhelmed the effect of NOx emissions on trends in m-values of NO$_3^-$ in 1990-2003, while the reverse was true in 2002-2011. However, other possibilities cannot be excluded. F$_{wet}$ of NO$_3^-$ and precipitation depth exhibited only a weakly significant correlation, with r = 0.58 and P<0.05 in 1988-2003 (the values in 1999 were excluded). Annual precipitation varied by only ~20% during the fifteen years, and this factor alone was unlikely to explain the ~100% interannual variation of F$_{wet}$ of NO$_3^-$ during that period.

The m-values of NH$_4^+$ at Site 1 had no significant correlation (r = 0.21 and P value
>0.05) with the emissions of NH$_3$ in Québec but exhibited a weakly significant correlation ($r = 0.60$ and P value <0.05) with the emissions of NH$_3$ in Ontario. Nearly all of the NH$_4^+$ was associated with SO$_4^{2-}$ and NO$_3^-$ in the atmosphere (Cheng and Zhang, 2017; Teng et al., 2017; Tost et al., 2007; Zhang et al., 2012), and the trends in the m-value of NH$_4^+$ could be affected by many other factors besides NH$_3$ emissions and climate anomalies.

LR analysis of the annual F$_{wet}$ of these ions revealed decreasing trends for SO$_4^{2-}$ and NO$_3^-$ (second row in Fig. 2). The M-K method analysis also confirmed the decreasing trends with annual F$_{wet}$ as input. However, the three-phase trends in F$_{wet}$ of SO$_4^{2-}$ and the two-phase trends in F$_{wet}$ of NO$_3^-$ and related inflection points, identified using the m-values discussed above, were not identified by the t-test when simply using annual F$_{wet}$ data as input. The correlations between annual F$_{wet}$ and emissions were 0.89 for SO$_4^{2-}$ vs. SO$_2$ in Ontario and 0.74-0.76 for NO$_3^-$ vs. NO$_x$ in Québec and Ontario (P values <0.01), while the corresponding r values were as high as 0.95 and 0.84-0.85 between m-values and emissions. After reducing the perturbations from climatic factors to the annual F$_{wet}$, stronger correlations were obtained between F$_{wet}$ and emissions.

The stable trend in annual F$_{wet}$ of NH$_4^+$ and the decreasing trend in annual F$_{wet}$ of NO$_3^-$ gradually increased the relative contributions of reduced nitrogen in the total nitrogen wet deposition budget, e.g., from 40% in 1998-1999 to 52% in 2010-2011. A similar trend has also been recently reported in the U.S. (Li et al., 2016). Such a trend was mostly due to the mitigation of NOx rather than climate anomalies.

3.2 Decadal climate anomalies drove trends at Site 2
Fig. 3 shows the trend analysis results at Site 2. An obvious shift in the m-values and annual F\textsubscript{wet} occurred during 2001-2002, as detected by the t-test, i.e., the m-values of SO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{2-} oscillated approximately 1.15±0.11 in 1990-2001 and 0.76±0.02 in 2002-2011 (or 0.83±0.12 if the value in 2006-2007 was included), but with a significant difference between the two periods with P value <0.01. The annual F\textsubscript{wet} of SO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{2-} oscillated approximately 632±63 mg m\textsuperscript{-2} in 1990-2001 and 452±74 mg m\textsuperscript{-2} in 2002-2011, and the values between the two periods showed significant differences. The shift led to the m-values and annual F\textsubscript{wet} of SO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{2-} exhibiting a consistent decreasing trend by ~40% overall from 1990 to 2011 using the LR and the M-K method.

The emissions of SO\textsubscript{2} oscillated approximately 1.13±0.07 in 1990-2001 and 1.06±0.03 in 2002-2011 in British Columbia, which did not support the large decrease of approximately 40% in wet deposition of SO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{2-} in 2002-2011. Statistically, no correlation existed between annual F\textsubscript{wet} of SO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{2-} and the emissions of SO\textsubscript{2} in British Columbia, with r = 0.52 and P value >0.05. Although the transboundary transport of air pollutants from the U.S. cannot be excluded, the almost constant m-values from 2002 to 2011 (excluding 2006-2007) at Site 2 were inconsistent with the approximately 70% decrease in emissions of SO\textsubscript{2} in the state of Washington in the U.S. during that period (not shown). Precipitation cannot explain the jump in wet deposition either, because there was no corresponding jump in precipitation during 2001-2002 (Fig. 3b).

van Donkelaar et al. (2008) analyzed aircraft and satellite measurements from the Intercontinental Chemical Transport Experiment and proposed the long-range transport of sulfur from East Asia to the west coast of Canada. The average wind fields in 1990-2011 at different altitudes also showed air masses primarily originating from the Pacific.
Ocean in the west (Fig. 4a). However, the climate anomalies of wind fields in 1990-2001 compared against 1990-2011 clearly showed a counterclockwise pattern in the corresponding coastal area, including Site 2, while a clockwise pattern existed in 2002-2011 against 1990-2011 (Fig. 4b, c). The decadal climate anomalies of wind fields in 2002-2011 very likely caused a large decrease in the contribution of air pollutants from the eastern coast to Site 2, resulting in a distinct demarcation at 2002. This hypothesis was also supported by a large rebound of the m-value in 2006-2007, due to the increase in $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{SO}_4^{2-}$ in 2007. The climate anomalies of wind fields in 2007 against 1990-2011 showed a counterclockwise pattern in the north, while the clockwise pattern was pushed to the south (Fig. 4d). A greater contribution of air pollutants from the eastern coast to Site 2 might have led to the large increase in $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{SO}_4^{2-}$ during a few month-long periods in 2007.

The present study is the first one to identify the decreasing trend in the annual $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{SO}_4^{2-}$ as being very likely caused by decadal climate anomalies rather than by the emission reductions of $\text{SO}_2$. The decadal climate anomalies may substantially alter the long-range transport of air pollutants to the reception site. Note that the causes for the decadal climate anomalies in this region are beyond the scope of the present study, but some information can be found in the literature (Bond et al., 2003; Coopersmith et al., 2014; Deng et al., 2014).

For the wet deposition of $\text{NO}_3^-$, the m-values also showed a clear shift, i.e., the m-values oscillated approximately $1.09 \pm 0.14$ in 1990-2001 and $0.88 \pm 0.06$ in 2002-2011, with a significant difference between the two periods under the t-test with P value <0.01. The annual $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{NO}_3^-$ varied substantially, and the shift could not be identified...
statistically. However, the annual $F_{\text{wet}}$ of NO$_3^-$ exhibited a decreasing trend by M-K method analysis. Similar to the case of SO$_4^{2-}$, no significant correlation ($r = 0.49$, $P$ value $>0.05$) existed between the annual $F_{\text{wet}}$ of NO$_3^-$ and the emissions of NOx in British Columbia.

In addition to decadal climate anomalies, the interannual climate variability also affected the trends in m-values and annual $F_{\text{wet}}$ of NO$_3^-$. The perturbations from interannual climate variability cannot be completely removed by the new approach, and they complicate the relationship between the $F_{\text{wet}}$ of NO$_3^-$ and the emissions of NOx in British Columbia. For example, the m-values in 1990-1991, 1996-1997, 1998-1999 and 2000-2001 were nearly constant at $1.17 \pm 0.03$. However, the NOx emissions in British Columbia in 1998-1999 were 26% greater than those in 1990-1991. There was a sharp decrease in the NOx emissions (by $\sim$30%) from 2002 to 2011 in British Columbia. However, the m-values oscillated approximately $0.88 \pm 0.06$ and showed no clear trend based on either the M-K method or LR analysis. The interannual climate variability apparently negated the impact of reduced emissions during these periods.

The m-values and the annual $F_{\text{wet}}$ of NH$_4^+$ oscillated approximately $0.99 \pm 0.13$ and $81 \pm 16$ mg m$^{-3}$, respectively, in the period of 1990-2011, and showed no trend (Fig. 3). Neither the m-values nor annual $F_{\text{wet}}$ of NH$_4^+$ showed the two-period distribution pattern or had any significant correlation with the emissions of NH$_3$ in British Columbia at a 95% confidence level. Similarly to Site 1, the annual variation in $F_{\text{wet}}$ of NH$_4^+$ at Site 2 cannot be simply explained by known emission trends.

In summary, decadal climate anomalies overwhelmingly determined the long-term
trends in the wet deposition of SO$_4^{2-}$ and NO$_3^-$, with the perturbation from monthly and annual climate anomalies removed at Site 2. The interannual climate variability further complicated the trends, resulting in undetectable influences of the emission trends on the deposition trends. Since the decrease in F$_{\text{wet}}$ of NO$_3^-$ appeared to be primarily caused by climate anomalies, the relative contributions of NH$_4^+$ and NO$_3^-$ in the total N wet deposition varied little, i.e., 33% versus 67% in 2010-2011 and 31% versus 69% in 1990-1991.

3.3 Regional trends in wet deposition in northern Ontario and Québec

Trends in the m-values or annual F$_{\text{wet}}$ of ions at Sites 3 and 4 in the northern regions of Ontario were generally similar to those found at Site 1 (Fig. S5 and S6). For example, the three-phase trend in m-values of SO$_4^{2-}$ and the two-phase trend in m-values of NO$_3^-$ were also obtained at Sites 3 and 4 after excluding a few m-values that were caused by large perturbations from climate anomalies. Thus, Sites 1, 3 and 4 were combined together to study regional trends in the northern areas of Ontario and Québec (Fig. 5a-c). Similar to those found at the individual sites, the temporal profile of regional m-values of SO$_4^{2-}$ can be clearly classified into three phases (Fig. 5a) as follows: Phase 1 from 1988 to 1993 with m-values oscillating approximately 1.31±0.08, Phase 2 from 1994 to 2003 with near-constant m-values of 1.05±0.04, and Phase 3 for 2004 onward with a decreasing trend by an overall ~50%. Significant differences of m-values existed between any two of the three phases, based on the t-test results (P value <0.01). The PRL result is expressed as below:

$$m - \text{value} = \begin{cases} 1.31, 1988 \leq x < 1994 \\ 1.05, 1994 \leq x < 2004 \\ -0.129 \times \left( \frac{x}{2} - 1001 \right) + 1.03, 2004 \leq x \leq 2010 \end{cases}$$

The three-phase pattern of m-values matched well with the three-phase emission profile...
of SO$_2$ in Ontario. Statistically, an ~70% decrease in m-value and an ~70% decrease in emissions were found from 1990 to 2011, with a correlation of $r = 0.95$ (P value <0.01).

The profile of the regional m-values of NO$_3^-$ also clearly exhibited two phases, according to the following t-test results between them: Phase 1 from 1988 to 2003, with m-values narrowly varying approximately 1.11±0.05 and Phase 2 from 2004 to 2011, with a decreasing trend by an overall ~40% against that in 2002-2003 (Fig. 5b). The PRL result is expressed as below:

$$\begin{cases} m-value = 1.11, 1988 \leq x < 2004 \\ m-value = -0.11 \ast \left( \frac{x}{2} - 1001 \right) + 1.03, 2004 \leq x \leq 2010 \end{cases}$$

From 2002 to 2011, the m-value had a moderately good correlation with the NOx emission in Ontario ($r = 0.91$, P<0.01), and the two variables decreased by 30-40% in this period. From 1990 to 2003, the near constant m-value was, however, inconsistent with the bell-shape profile of the NOx emissions in Ontario and Québec, which could be due to either the perturbation from climate anomalies or unrealistic emissions inventory. Considering that the first possibility was minimal over a large regional scale, especially when the consistency was determined in a different time frame (2002-2011) in the same region, it is thus doubtful that the bell-shape profile of the NOx emissions in 1990-2003 was realistic.

The regional m-values of NH$_4^+$ largely oscillated from 1988 to 2003 (Fig. 5c). The m-values of NH$_4^+$, however, decreased by ~30% from 2002 to 2011, leading to a probable decreasing trend in m-value from 1988 to 2011. No correlation was found between the m-values of NH$_4^+$ and the emissions of NH$_3$ in Ontario, which is consistent with the findings at the individual sites discussed above.
Since the decrease in F wet values of NO₃⁻ at Sites 3 and 4 were very likely due to the mitigation of NOx in Ontario, the decrease also changed the relative contributions between NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ in the total N wet deposition budget. For example, NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ contributed 52% and 48%, respectively, to the total budget in 2010-2011 and 34% and 66%, respectively, in 1984-1985 at Site 3. The corresponding numbers at Site 4 were 58% and 42% in 2010-2011 and 47% and 53% in 1985-1986.

4 Conclusions

Climate anomalies during the two-decade period resulted in annual F wet of SO₄²⁻ and/or NO₃⁻ deviating from the normal value by up to ~40% at the rural Canadian sites. The new approach of rearranging and screening F wet data can largely reduce the impact of climate anomalies when used for generating the decadal trends of F wet. With the climate perturbation being reduced, F wet of SO₄²⁻ exhibited a three-phase decreasing trend at every individual site, as well as on a regional scale in northern Ontario and Québec. The three-phase pattern of the decreasing trend in F wet of SO₄²⁻ matches well with the emission trends of SO₂ in Ontario, as supported by the good correlation between wet deposition and emission, with r ≥0.95 and P<0.01. F wet of NO₃⁻ exhibited a two-phase decreasing trend, but only during the second phase F wet of NO₃⁻ and the emissions of NOx in Ontario and Québec matched well, with a good correlation of r ≥0.91 and P<0.01. Compared to the results obtained without applying the new approach, it is concluded that, after reducing the perturbation from climate anomalies, 1) better correlation was obtained between F wet of ions and the emission of the corresponding gaseous precursors in northern Ontario and Québec, and 2) the inflection points in the decreasing trends of F wet of SO₄²⁻ and NO₃⁻ were clearly identified.
However, the new approach cannot completely remove the perturbations from climate anomalies, especially when this is the dominant factor and/or on long timescales, as was the case at a coastal site of Saturna in British Columbia. At this location, the decreasing trends in $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{SO}_4^{2-}$ and $\text{NO}_3^-$ were caused by the decadal climate anomalies, as well as being affected by interannual climate variability, which overwhelmed the impact of the emission changes of the gaseous precursors in this province. This is the first study that has identified that decadal climate anomalies can dominate trends in $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{SO}_4^{2-}$ and $\text{NO}_3^-$. The long-term variations in $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{NH}_4^+$ generally showed no clear long-term trends. Moreover, no apparent cause-effect relationships were found between the wet deposition of $\text{NH}_4^+$ and the emission of NH$_3$. This outcome is not surprising because additional key factors besides those discussed in this study also impact the trends of $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{NH}_4^+$. For example, $\text{NH}_4^+$ may be more greatly impacted by changes in $\text{SO}_2$ and NOx than are NH$_3$ emissions in NH$_3$-rich scenarios. It should be noted that $F_{\text{wet}}$ of N via $\text{NH}_4^+$ exceeded those via $\text{NO}_3^-$ in 2010 and 2011 in northern Ontario and Québec, where the decrease in $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{NO}_3^-$ was associated with decreasing NOx emissions. In contrast, $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{NH}_4^+$ did not exceed $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{NO}_3^-$ in 2010 and 2011 in the coastal area in British Columbia, where the decreasing trends of $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{NO}_3^-$ were determined to result mainly from the perturbation by climate anomalies.

Data availability. Data used in this study are available from the corresponding authors. Supplement. The supplement materials are available online. Author contribution. X. Y. and L. Z. designed the study, analyzed the data and prepared the manuscript. Competing interests. The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest. Acknowledgments. X.Y. is supported by the National Key Research and Development Program in
References


Lajtha, K., and Jones, J.: Trends in cation, nitrogen, sulfate and hydrogen ion concentrations...


List of Figures

Figure 1. Fitting monthly $F_{\text{wet}}$ of $\text{SO}_4^{2-}$ against the climatology values from every two years using LR with zero interception at Site 1, according to the new approach described in Section 2. * reflects the maximum value excluded for LR analysis. Fitted lines represent the LR function with zero interception.

Figure 2. m-values and annual $F_{\text{wet}}$ extracted trends at Site 1, and the annual emissions of air pollutants in Québec and Ontario, Canada. Full and empty markers in blue in (a), (b) and (g) represent the calculation of m-values without and with the outlier, respectively. Empty markers in red represent the outliers in m-values and are excluded for trend analysis, as detailed in Section 2. $R^2$ reflects the coefficient of determination of a variable against the calendar year from LR analysis, and the fitted lines represent the LR function.

Figure 3. Identical to Fig. 1, except for Site 2, and the annual precipitation and annual emissions in British Columbia, Canada. Horizontal dashes in (b) represent precipitation, and the fitted lines represent the LR function.

Figure 4. Average wind fields in 1990-2011 (a) and anomalies at 925 hpa in 1990-2001 (b), 2002-2011 (excluding 2007) (c), and 2007 (d) in western coastal Canada and the U.S.

Figure 5. Regional m-values at Sites 1, 3 and 4: (a): $\text{SO}_4^{2-}$, (b): $\text{NO}_3^-$, and (c): $\text{NH}_4^+$. 

https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-2019-418
Preprint. Discussion started: 25 June 2019
© Author(s) 2019. CC BY 4.0 License.
Figure 1. Fitting monthly $F_{wet}^*$ of $SO_4^{2-}$ against the climatology values from every two years using LR with zero interception at Site 1, according to the new approach described in Section 2. * reflects the maximum value excluded for LR analysis. Fitted lines represent the LR function with zero interception.
Figure 2. m-values and annual F_{wet} extracted trends at Site 1, and the annual emissions of air pollutants in Québec and Ontario, Canada. Full and empty markers in blue in (a), (b) and (g) represent the calculation of m-values without and with the outlier, respectively. Empty markers in red represent the outliers in m-values and are excluded for trend analysis, as detailed in Section 2. R^2 reflects the coefficient of determination of a variable against the calendar year from LR analysis, and the fitted lines represent the LR function.
Figure 3. Identical to Fig. 1, except for Site 2, and the annual precipitation and annual emissions in British Columbia.

Canada. Horizontal dashes in (b) represent precipitation, and the fitted lines represent the LR function.
Figure 4. Average wind fields in 1990-2011 (a) and anomalies at 925 hpa in 1990-2001 (b), 2002-2011 (excluding 2007) (c), and 2007 (d) in western coastal Canada and the U.S.
Figure 5. Regional m-values at Sites 1, 3 and 4: (a) SO$_4^{2-}$, (b) NO$_3^-$, and (c) NH$_4^+$.