Interactive comment on “Wintertime secondary organic aerosol formation in Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei (BTH): Contributions of HONO sources and heterogeneous reactions” by Li Xing et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 3 October 2018

LiXing et al. present a modeling study of SOA formation pathways and contribution of heterogeneous HONO sources in the BTH region focusing on wintertime haze. This is an important study. I have several suggestions for strengthening the Manuscript, and I recommend that the following points need to be addressed before publication:

1. Introduction line 43: Please clarify if biogenic POA refers to POA from biomass burning and/or biological particles like bacteria, fungi etc.?

2. Line 46: In addition to Robinson and Hallquist, suggest citing the recent review paper on SOA by Shrivastava et al. 2017 (1)

3. Line 85: Also cite the global modeling paper using VBS by Shrivastava et al. 2015 (1)
4. Line 100: The difference between the 2-product model and VBS is also because the VBS accounts for semi-volatile and intermediate volatility organics emitted from fossil fuel and biomass burning sources in addition to traditional SOA. This needs to be mentioned here.

5. Line 115: Please mention the different SOA sources being represented by VBS: e.g., anthropogenic, biomass burning, biogenic. Also, was gas-phase fragmentation of organic vapors included during multigenerational aging of organic vapors in the VBS? Please see the following papers for reference: (References 2, 4, 5 listed below)

6. Section 3.1. POA simulations and Figure 2: It is confusing why POA and HOA are on separate panels. POA is generally compared against the HOA factor derived from PMF analysis of HR-Tof-AMS data. Please clarify what is model POA being compared to in panel 2(a) and what is PMF AMS HOA being compared to in panel 2(b)? Also I do not see a comparison for PMF OOA and model SOA.

7. Also, can the authors compare their glyoxal and methylglyoxal to some of the AMS factors? If not, can AMS total organic signal – (sum of HOA+BBOA+CCOA+COA) be used as an estimate of glyoxal/methylglyoxal? If not, please explain. For example, are there any distinct AMS makers for glyoxal/methylglyoxal SOA or aqueous SOA formed during Haze? What was the overall O:C ratio of AMS organic aerosol?

8. Section 3.3: The authors include glyoxal SOA, but seems they do not include isoprene epoxydiol (IEPOX SOA) which is also formed by aqueous chemistry. Is the IEPOX-SOA contribution expected to be insignificant?

9. Line 270-275: What sources contribute to residential living? Are these biofuel burning? Also, could glyoxal and methylglyoxal also be emitted from wildfires and agricultural waste burning?

10. Figure 3: In addition to observed average diurnal cycle, also include modeled
diurnal cycle average for O3 and HONO. For HONO please include both the base and HOMO cases from Figure 4.

References:


