Dear Editor,

After reading the comments from both referees, we have carefully revised our manuscript. Our responses to the two referees’ comments are itemized below and also highlighted in the revised manuscript by using yellow color.

Anything about our manuscript, please feel free to contact us by wanggh@ieecas.cn (Prof. Gehui Wang) or renyi-zhang@tamu.edu (Prof. Renyi Zhang)

Best regards!

Gehui Wang
05/28, 2018

Anonymous Referee #1
General comments:
(1) Comments:
The manuscript presents field and laboratory results of sulfate formation during winter haze conditions in China. It points to the potentially important role that organics play in aerosol acidity and hygroscopic growth in China. An important finding is that SO2 oxidation by NO2, a new mechanism proposed for Beijing winter haze, is significant only on oxalic acid as seed particles, but not on ammonium sulfate due to the strong acidity. This finding was not stressed in the earlier work of the authors (Wang et al. 2016, PNAS). The paper is well written for most parts and should be published in ACP after the following comments are addressed.
Response: We thank the reviewer for the comments above.

(2) Comments:
My main comment is the representativeness of the lab experiment for atmospheric conditions in winter haze in China. I would expect the organics and inorganic compounds are mixed in ambient aerosol particles, so there will not exist pure oxalic acid aerosol or pure ammonium sulfate aerosol as used in the chamber experiments. I would suggest the authors discuss this issue in the manuscript, particularly with regard to how their proposed mechanism should be adopted in models where aerosols are typically assumed internally mixed.
Response: We agree with the reviewer that organic and inorganic compounds are mixed in ambient aerosol particles, and there are no pure oxalic acid aerosols or pure ammonium sulfate aerosols in the atmosphere. In fact, in our chamber experiment the seeded particles were initially pure oxalic acid and became a mixture of ammonium oxalate and ammonium sulfate with the proceeding of the formation of sulfate on the seeded oxalic acid particles. Based on our laboratory simulation, we calculated the uptake coefficient SO2 on oxalic acid particles in the reaction chamber, which is 8.3±5.7x 10⁻⁵ (Table S6, Wang et al., 2016) under the humid conditions and consistent with that (4.5±1.1x10⁻⁵) (Table S6, Wang et al.,
2016) observed in Beijing during the haze period of 2015. Such a consistence indicates that our chamber results including the uptake coefficient would be applicable for model simulation. We added those related discussions into the text. See page 13-14, line 313-322.

Specific comments:
(3) Comments:
Figure 1 shows no particle growth with ammonium sulfate as the seed particle. It would be convenient to compare the same growth chart with oxalic acid as the seed particle.
Response: Suggestion taken. We added the growth of the seeded oxalic acid particles into the figure for the comparison. See Figure 2 and related statements in page 7, line 167-169.

(4) Comments:
Figure 2: the graph shows growth of oxalic acid seed particles in the chamber experiments at different RH. How much of the growth is due to water and how much is it due to sulfate formation?
Response: Figure 2 shows the hygroscopic growth factor of oxalic acid measured by a HTDMA system, which is not the growth of oxalic acid seed particles in the chamber experiment.

(5) Comments:
Figure 3. Please add sulfate time series and discuss if sulfate correlates with WSOC and/or oxalic acid.
Response: Suggestion taken. We have revised the figure by adding sulfate time series (see Figure 3 g and h). As shown in Figure 3g and h, during the field observation periods sulfate at the three sites showed a temporal variation pattern similar to that of oxalic acid with a robust linear correlation ($r^2=0.67, 0.84$ and 0.61 in Xi’an, Beijing and Hebei Province, respectively). Such a correlation was also reported by other researchers (Wang et al, 2017, Yu et al, 2005), suggesting the cooccurrence of both compounds in atmospheric aerosols. The related discussion was added into the revised manuscript. See page 10, line 227-235.

Anonymous Referee #2
General comments:
(1) Comments
The manuscript “Particle acidity and sulfate production during severe haze events in China cannot be reliably inferred by assuming a mixture of inorganic salts” of Gehui Wang et al. presents laboratory measurements on the hygroscopicity and particle growth of selected particles under controlled conditions. The work contributes to the current understanding of the aqueous oxidation of SO2 by NO2. The authors also report on field measurements of the chemical composition of the water soluble fraction of fine PM in three sites in China during winter episodes. The results suggest little sulfate production in aqueous ammonium sulfate particles due to high acidity, whereas high sulfate production is observed from
oxalic acid particles due to low acidity. The manuscript is well written and the results are relevant and I recommend the publication of the manuscript after the following aspects are addressed.

**Response:** We thank the reviewer’s comments above.

(2) **Comments:**
In Section 2, add a detailed description of the sampling conditions during the field measurements for the three sites in terms of meteorology (with emphasis on RH and T), sampling size, and a qualitative description of the emission sources potentially impacting the observations. In Section 4, discuss whether any of these sampling conditions can also contribute to the observed differences.

**Response:** Suggestion taken. We have added the detailed descriptions on the sampling conditions at the three sites including RH, temperature, particle cutoff size and a qualitative description of the potential emissions sources. See the above information on page 6, line 135-140. We also discussed whether these sampling conditions can also contribute to the observed differences. See page 9, line 219-221.

(3) **Comments:**
How similar are the chemical and thermodynamic conditions in the laboratory measurements to actual haze conditions during the field measurements? The authors should also explicitly address the caveats of extrapolating the laboratory results in terms of mixing state, acidity, and chemical organic composition (organic mass factions are typically large during these events).

**Response:** The concentrations of gases we used for the chamber simulation are about 10 times higher than those in Beijing, but their relative abundances and the relative humidity are similar to those during the field measurements. As discussed above, the uptake coefficient of SO$_2$ on oxalic acid particles extrapolated from our laboratory measurements is similar to that in Beijing during the observation period, which suggests that our proposed mechanism is applicable to the actual haze conditions in China. Based on the field measurement and model simulation, Cheng et al (2016) also reported a similar result, corroborating our lab work results. As reply to referee #1, we have added related discussions into the text, see page 9, line 199-202, and page 14, line 316-322.

(4) **Comments:**
The results in figure 2 show a large increase in the hygroscopic growth factor of oxalic acid particles when increasing RH. Can the authors discuss possible reasons why these results differ from those of Peng et al., 2001 under high RH?

**Response:** The difference of hygroscopic growth factors of oxalic acid particles between Peng et al 2001 and this study is mainly due to the different methods used for the hygroscopicity measurement. In the work of Peng et al (2001), they used an electrodynamic balance (EDB) system to trap and levitate a charged particle. The relative mass of a particle equilibrated at different relative humidities was determined by measuring the balancing voltage. The size of each particle studied was not measured but was estimated from visual inspection using a microscope (Peng et al., 2001). In contrast,
the hygroscopicity of oxalic acid in this study was measured by using a hygroscopicity tandem differential mobility analyzer (HTDMA) system. The particle size was measured by a SMPS (scanning mobility particle sizer). The EDB system measured the size of a charged particle through determining its optical property, while the HTDMA system measured by the SMPS system through determining its mobility in the electric field. In addition, the size range of oxalic acid particles measured by Peng et al (2001) is different from that measured by this study. The size range of charged oxalic acid droplet measured by the EDB system is 10-20 microns, while that measured by the HTDMA system in this study is less than 1.0 micron. As shown in Figure 2, our result is very close to that measured by Mikhailov et al (2009) and Prenni et al (2001), who also used a HTDMA system for the hygroscopcity measurement, further suggesting that the difference between the measured growth factors is due to the different methods. We briefly explained this difference in the revised version, see page 7-8, line 175-180.

References
Particle acidity and sulfate production during severe haze events in China cannot be reliably inferred by assuming a mixture of inorganic salts

Gehui Wang1,2,3,*, Fang Zhang4,5, Jianfei Peng5,6, Lian Duan5,7, Yuemeng Ji5,8, Wilmarie Marrero-Ortiz5, Jiayuan Wang2, Jianjun Li2, Can Wu2, Cong Cao2, Yuan Wang9, Jun Zheng10, Jeremiah Secrest5, Yixin Li5, Yuying Wang4,5, Hong Li11, Na Li5,12, and Renyi Zhang5,6*

1Key Laboratory of Geographic Information Science of the Ministry of Education, School of Geographic Sciences, East China Normal University, Shanghai 200241, China
2State Key Laboratory of Loess and Quaternary Geology, Institute of Earth Environment, China Academy of Sciences, Xi’an 710061, China
3Center for Excellence in Regional Atmospheric Environment, Institute of Urban Environment, Chinese Academy of Science, Xiamen, China
4Beijing Normal University, Beijing 100875, China
5Departments of Atmospheric Sciences and Chemistry, Texas A&M University, College Station, TX, 77843, USA
6State Key Joint Laboratory of Environmental Simulation and Pollution Control, College of Environmental Sciences and Engineering, Peking University, Beijing 100871, China
7East China University of Science and Technology, Shanghai, China
8School of Environmental Science and Engineering, Institute of Environmental Health and Pollution, Control, Guangdong University of Technology, Guangzhou 510006, China
9Jet Propulsion Laboratory, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, CA 91125, USA
10Jiangsu Key Laboratory of Atmospheric Environment Monitoring and Pollution Control, Nanjing University of Information Science & Technology, Nanjing 210044, China
11State Key Laboratory of Environmental Criteria and Risk Assessment, Chinese Research Academy of Environmental Sciences, Beijing 100012, China
12Key Laboratory of Songliao Aquatic Environment, Jilin Jianzhu University, Changchun, 130118, China

*Corresponding author:
Prof. Gehui Wang, E-mail: ghwang@geo.ecnu.edu.cn, or wanggh@ieecas.cn
Prof. Renyi Zhang, E-mail: renyi-zhang@tamu.edu
Abstract: Atmospheric measurements showed rapid sulfate formation during severe haze episodes in China, with fine particulate matter (PM) consisting of a multi-component mixture that is dominated by organic species. Several recent studies using the thermodynamic model estimated the particle acidity and sulfate production rate, by treating the PM exclusively as a mixture of inorganic salts dominated by ammonium sulfate and neglecting the effects of organic compounds. Noticeably, the estimated pH and sulfate formation rate during pollution periods in China were highly conflicting among the previous studies. Here we show that a particle mixture of inorganic salts adopted by the previous studies does not represent a suitable model system and that the acidity and sulfate formation cannot be reliably inferred without accounting for the effects of multi-aerosol compositions during severe haze events in China. Our laboratory experiments show that SO₂ oxidation by NO₂ with NH₃ neutralization on fine aerosols is dependent on the particle hygroscopicity, phase-state, and acidity. Ammonium sulfate and oxalic acid seed particles exposed to vapors of SO₂, NO₂, and NH₃ at high relative humidity (RH) exhibit distinct size growth and sulfate formation. Aqueous ammonium sulfate particles exhibit little sulfate production, in contrast to aqueous oxalic acid particles with significant sulfate production. Our field measurements demonstrate significant contribution of water-soluble organic matter to fine PM in China and indicate that the use of oxalic acid in laboratory experiments is representative of ambient organic dominant aerosols. While the particle acidity cannot be accurately determined from field measurements or calculated using the thermodynamic model, our results reveal that the pH value of ambient organics-dominated aerosols is sufficiently high to promote efficient SO₂ oxidation by NO₂ with NH₃ neutralization under polluted conditions in China.
1. Introduction

Atmospheric measurements have demonstrated rapid sulfate production during severe haze events in China (Guo et al., 2014; Wang et al., 2014; Zhang et al., 2015; Cheng et al., 2016; Wang et al., 2016). For example, Wang et al. (2016) showed that during pollution episodes in Xi’an of China the SO$_4^{2-}$ mass concentration increased markedly from less than 10, 10-20, to greater than 20 μg m$^{-3}$, with the corresponding increases in the mean PM$_{2.5}$ mass concentrations from 43, 139, to 250 μg m$^{-3}$ from clean, transition, to polluted periods, respectively. Among the PM$_{2.5}$ species in Xi’an, organic matter (OM), nitrate (NO$_3^{-}$), and SO$_4^{2-}$ were most abundant, with the mass fractions of 55%, 14%, and 14%, respectively, during the polluted period. In addition, the work by Wang et al. (2016) demonstrated that the molar ratio of SO$_4^{2-}$ to SO$_2$, which reflects sulfur partitioning between the particle and gas phases, exhibited an exponential increase with relative humidity (RH), with the values of less than 0.1 at RH < 20% to 1.1 at RH > 90% in Xi’an. Similar evolutions in SO$_4^{2-}$ mass concentrations and the molar ratio of SO$_4^{2-}$ to SO$_2$ were shown during the pollution development in Beijing (Sun et al., 2013; Wang et al., 2014; Wang et al., 2016). The rapid sulfate formation measured in China could not be explained by current atmospheric models and suggested missing sulfur oxidation mechanisms (Wang et al., 2014). Typically, high sulfate levels during haze events in China occurred concurrently with elevated RH, NO$_x$, and NH$_3$ (Wang et al., 2014; Zhang et al., 2015; Wang et al., 2016), implicating an aqueous sulfur oxidation pathway. On the basis of complementary field and experimental measurements, Wang et al. (2016) concluded that the aqueous oxidation of SO$_2$ by NO$_2$ is key to efficient sulfate formation, but is only feasible under two atmospheric conditions, i.e., on fine aerosols with high RH and NH$_3$ neutralization or under cloud conditions.

Several recent studies estimated the particle acidity and aqueous sulfate production during
severe haze events in China using the thermodynamic model (Cheng et al., 2016; Guo et al., 2017; Liu et al., 2017). For example, Cheng et al. (2016) estimated a pH range of 5.4 to 6.2 using a thermodynamic model (ISORROPIA-II) in Beijing. On the basis of their estimated pH and the previous experimental rates of SO₂ oxidation by NO₂ and the Henry’s Law constants for sulfur dioxide (SO₂), bisulfite (HSO₃⁻), and sulfite (SO₃²⁻) from the literature (Lee and Schwartz, 1983; Clifton et al., 1988; Seinfeld and Pandis, 2006), the authors derived a sulfate production rate and concluded that reactive nitrogen chemistry in aerosol water explained the sulfate formation during polluted periods in Beijing. In contrast, other recent studies by Guo et al. (2017) and Liu et al. (2017) adopted the similar method as Cheng et al. (2016), but reported significantly different values of pH and the sulfate formation rates by the aqueous SO₂ oxidation by NO₂ in China. Those two later studies determined a pH range of 3.0-4.9 and suggested that fine particles were moderately acidic and the aqueous SO₂ oxidation by NO₂ was unimportant during severe wintertime haze periods in China.

In this article, we conducted laboratory measurements of the hygroscopicity for oxalic acid particles and particle growth of ammonium sulfate particles upon exposure to SO₂, NO₂, and NH₃ at high RH conditions, in order to evaluate the dominant factors regulating the aqueous oxidation of SO₂ by NO₂. In addition, field measurements of chemical compositions of water-soluble fraction for fine PM (including oxalic acid) in Beijing, Hebei Province, and Xi’an of China were performed during the winter haze episodes, showing significantly enriched water-soluble organic matter (WSOM). The implications for the multi-aerosol chemical compositions on the pH value and sulfate production during winter pollution periods in China are discussed.

2. Methods

2.1 Aqueous phase oxidation of SO₂ by NO₂ in an environmental chamber
The experimental method using the environmental chamber has been discussed elsewhere (Wang et al., 2016), and here we only provide a brief description. The aqueous SO$_2$ oxidation experiments was conducted by exposing size-selected (NH$_4$)$_2$SO$_4$ seed particles to different levels of SO$_2$, NO$_2$, and NH$_3$ at variable RH conditions in a 1 m$^3$ Teflon reaction chamber covered with aluminum foil. A differential mobility analyzer (DMA) equipped with a condensation particle counter (CPC) was used to measure the particle growth in diameter, in order to determine sulfate formation on seeded particles (Wang et al., 2016).

2.2 Measurement of hygroscopic growth factor of oxalic acid

Hygroscopic growth factor (HGF) of oxalic acid was measured according to the method previously discussed (Khalizov et al., 2009; Pagels et al., 2009). Briefly, a hygroscopicity tandem differential mobility analyzer (HTDMA) coupled to a condensation particle counter (CPC, TSI 3762) was used for the HGF measurement. Size-selected oxalic acid particles with the dry diameter of 100 nm were exposed to increasing RH from 8% to 92% with a step range from 1%-10%. HGF is defined as the ratio of oxalic acid particle diameter ($D_p$) measured by the second DMA at an elevated RH to the initial diameter ($D_0 = 100$ nm) of the particles selected by the first DMA at the dry conditions of RH = 8% (Peng et al., 2016).

2.3 Chemical composition of PM$_{2.5}$ in Beijing, Hebei Province, and Xi’an, China

PM$_{2.5}$ samples were collected onto pre-baked (450°C for 6 hr) quartz fiber filter by using a high-volume air sampler with an airflow rate of 1.03 m$^3$ min$^{-1}$. The sample collection in Xi’an was performed on the roof of a three-story building in the urban center with a 1-hour interval for each sample during the winter of 2012 (Wang et al., 2016). The sample collection in Beijing was conducted during the winter of 2016 on the roof of a four-story building on the campus of China Research Academy of Environmental Sciences, which is located at the northern part of Beijing.
The PM$_{2.5}$ samples in Hebei Province were collected during the winter of 2016 on the roof of a three-story building on the campus of the Institute of Hydrology and Environmental Geology, which is located in Zhengding County of Hebei Province. Both sample collections in Beijing and Hebei Province were performed on a day/night basis. After collection, all samples were sealed individually in an aluminum foil bag and stored in a freezer below -18°C prior to analysis. During the sampling periods temperatures were -6.0 ± 4.0°C (-15–1.0°C), -4.0 ± 3.0°C (-12–2.0°C) and 1.6 ± 4.4°C (-5.4–15°C) in Beijing, Hebei Province and Xi’an, respectively, while relative humidity at the three sites (RH) were 37 ± 18% (16–87%), 46 ± 21% (16–87%) and 59 ± 21% (15–95%), respectively. Previous observations showed that coal combustion, biomass burnings and vehicle exhausts are the three major sources of PM$_{2.5}$ during winter in North China including Beijing, Hebei Province and Xi’an (Li et al., 2016; Zhang et al., 2015).

The detailed procedures for the analysis of inorganic ions and water-soluble organic matter (WSOM) in aerosols have been reported elsewhere (Wang et al., 2009; Wang et al., 2010; Wang et al., 2017). Briefly, one part of the filter sample (area about 5 cm$^2$) was divided into several pieces, extracted with Mili-Q pure water, and determined for WSOM and inorganic ions by using Shimadzu TOC-L CPH analyzer and Dionex-600 ion chromatography, respectively. Oxalic acid in PM$_{2.5}$ was analyzed according to Wang et al. (2002) and Cheng et al. (2015). One part of the filter sample was extracted with Milli-Q water, concentrated to dryness, and reacted with 14% BF$_3$/butanol at 100°C for 1 hr. After the reaction, the derivatized sample was extracted with hexane for three times and concentrated into 1 mL. Oxalic acid in the samples was identified by gas chromatography–mass spectrometry (GC–MS) and quantified by gas chromatography (Agilent GC7890A).

3. Results
3.1 Aqueous oxidation of SO₂ by NO₂ with NH₃ neutralization

We first evaluated the factors controlling the aqueous phase oxidation of SO₂ by NO₂ using the environmental chamber method. The evolution in the size of ammonium sulfate particles after exposure to SO₂, NO₂, and NH₃ at different RH and SO₂ levels is shown in Figure 1. In our experiments, monodisperse particles with the initial dry particle size ranging from 50 to 70 nm were selected for the exposure, and two different SO₂ concentrations (37.5 and 375 parts per billions or ppb) were used. RH was maintained at a level of 80-98%, above the deliquescence point (79%) of ammonium sulfate (Qiu and Zhang, 2013) to ensure aqueous particles. As is shown in Figure 1, the size of (NH₄)₂SO₄ particles remains nearly invariant (within the experimental uncertainty) after exposure to SO₂, NO₂, and NH₃. A 10-fold increase in the SO₂ concentration has little effect on the growth of (NH₄)₂SO₄ particles. These results illustrate that sulfate production is insignificant and SO₂ cannot be efficiently oxidized by NO₂ in the presence of NH₃ on aqueous ammonium sulfate particles. The measurement of negligible growth for (NH₄)₂SO₄ particles exposed to SO₂, NO₂, and NH₃ at high RH is in contrast to the previous work by Wang et al. (2016), which showed large size growth and significant sulfate production for oxalic acid particles with NH₃ neutralization and under high RH conditions (see the black triangles in Figure 1).

To gain an insight into such a difference in the size growth between (NH₄)₂SO₄ and oxalic acid particles, we measured the hygroscopic growth of oxalic acid particles. Figure 2 displays the measured hygroscopic growth factor (HGF) of oxalic acid, showing an exponential increase with an increase in RH. The measured HGF value is close to unity at RH < 40% and increases from 1.1 at RH = 60% to 1.5 at RH = 90%. Our measured HGF for oxalic acid is consistent with the previous studies by Prenni et al. (2001) and Mikhailov et al. (2009); all of which were measured...
by using a hygroscopicity tandem differential mobility analyzer (HTDMA) system. On the other hand, another earlier experimental study showed little growth for oxalic acid particles under high RH conditions by using an electrodynamic balance (EDB) system (Peng et al., 2001). The different HGF measured for oxalic acid is most likely due to the different accuracies of the two types of methods for the hygroscopicity measurement. The measurements of HGF also provide information on the particle phase-state. As evident from Figure 2, oxalic acid particles mainly exist in a non-aqueous phase at RH < 40% but in the aqueous phase at RH > 60%.

Our present experiments of aqueous oxidation of SO$_2$ by NO$_2$ were performed at similar conditions as those by Wang et al. (2016), i.e., with comparable concentrations for SO$_2$, NO$_2$, and NH$_3$ and in the same phase-state (aqueous) for the particles. On the other hand, the particle acidity is clearly distinct between the two studies. Our present experiment is characterized by a lower pH value, since ammonium sulfate is rather acidic. For example, the pH value of 0.1M (NH$_4$)$_2$SO$_4$ solution is 5.5. The overall aqueous reaction between SO$_2$ and NO$_2$ in the presence of NH$_3$ is suggested as the following (Wang et al., 2016),

$$2\text{NH}_3(\text{g}) + \text{SO}_2(\text{g}) + 2\text{NO}_2(\text{g}) + 2\text{H}_2\text{O(}a\text{q)} \rightarrow 2\text{NH}_4^+(\text{aq}) + \text{SO}_4^{2-}(\text{aq}) + 2\text{HONO(g)}$$ (1)

Since the solubility of SO$_2$ decreases markedly with increasing particle acidity (Seinfeld and Pandis, 2006; Zhang et al., 2015), the heterogeneous reaction between SO$_2$ and NO$_2$ is prohibited on acidic (NH$_4$)$_2$SO$_4$ particles. On the other hand, under the experimental conditions by Wang et al. (2016), the heterogeneous reaction between oxalic acid and NH$_3$ occurred on aqueous particles in the presence of NH$_3$, yielding ammonium oxalate. The ammonium oxalate is expected to be less acidic than ammonium sulfate, because for a bulk solution the pH value of 0.1 M ammonium oxalate is 6.5 and one unit higher than that of ammonium sulfate. As a result, SO$_2$ readily dissolves into aqueous ammonium oxalate particles and is oxidized by NO$_2$ into
SO$_4^{2-}$, which is consequently neutralized by NH$_3$ to produce (NH$_4$)$_2$SO$_4$. The resulting aqueous ammonium oxalate/(NH$_4$)$_2$SO$_4$ particles, which is internally mixed, exhibit a lower acidity than that of pure (NH$_4$)$_2$SO$_4$ particles, responsible for a significant growth in the dry particle size and sulfate formation for the previous experiments by Wang et al. (2016).

Hence, the experimental studies of our present work and that by Wang et al. (2016) reveal that sulfate production on fine particles is dependent on several factors, including the particle hygroscopicity, phase-state, acidity, and RH, in addition to the gaseous concentrations of SO$_2$, NO$_2$, and NH$_3$. These experimental results indicate that the acidity and sulfate formation are distinct for organic seed and ammonium sulfate seed particles. While oxidation of SO$_2$ by NO$_2$ on aqueous (NH$_4$)$_2$SO$_4$ particles does not represent a viable mechanism because of a higher acidity, significant sulfate production occurs on oxalic acid particles because of a lower acidity.

### 3.2 Field measurements of WSOM in China

Atmospheric measurements have shown that the occurrence of severe haze episodes in China is accompanied with high RH conditions and PM$_{2.5}$ particles consist of large amounts of secondary organic and inorganic compounds. We present additional field measurements of the chemical composition of PM$_{2.5}$ in Beijing, Hebei Province, and Xi’an of China. Figure 3 shows that the wintertime PM$_{2.5}$ samples collected at the three locations. It is evident that WSOM is considerably enriched and their concentrations are comparable to those of the total inorganic ions (Figure 3a and b). For example, the mass concentration of WSOM ranges from 10 to 60 µg m$^{-3}$ in Beijing and Hebei Province during the winter of 2016 and from 10 to 180 µg m$^{-3}$ in Xi’an during the winter of 2012 (Figure 3c and d, respectively). Compared to those in Beijing and Hebei Province, the more abundant WSOM in Xi’an was caused by more emissions from biomass burning for house heating (Li et al., 2016). As seen in Figure 3c–f, the variation of
WSOM displays a temporal pattern similar to that of oxalic acid, with a linear correlation coefficient of 0.79, 0.88 and 0.72 in Beijing, Hebei Province, and Xi’an, respectively (Figure 3e and f). The mass concentration of oxalic acid in fine PM during the haze episodes is about 500 ng m^{-3} in Beijing and Hebei Province (Figure 3e) and more than 2000 ng m^{-3} in Xi’an (Figure 3f). Hence, our field measurements indicate that oxalic acid represents one of the most abundant WSOM in the aerosol-phase. Oxalic acid is a secondary product formed from the aqueous-phase oxidation of water-soluble organic precursors and ubiquitously exists in the troposphere. Like other pollutants, oxalic acid has been also shown to occur with large abundance in China (Wang et al., 2012; Cheng et al., 2013; Meng et al., 2014; Kawamura and Bikkina, 2016). As shown in Figure 3g and h, during the field observation periods sulfate at the three sites showed a temporal variation pattern similar to that of oxalic acid with a robust linear correlation (r^2=0.67, 0.84 and 0.61 in Xi’an, Beijing and Hebei Province, respectively). Such a correlation was also reported by other researchers (Wang et al., 2017, Yu et al., 2005), suggesting the cooccurrence and internally mixing state of both compounds in the atmosphere. In addition, the previous field measurements also revealed that WSOM in China is not only enriched in carboxylic acids (including oxalic acid) but also in other organic species, including carbonyls, amines, and water-soluble nitrogen-containing organic compounds (Wang et al., 2010, 2013; Zheng et al., 2015; Yao et al., 2016; Liu et al., 2017). The dominant organic acids and bases indicate that haze particles in China are multi-component in nature and the estimations of the particle acidity (or pH) and the sulfate production rate need to take into account of the effects of organic species, in addition to inorganic ions.

4. Discussions

Several recent studies using the thermodynamic models (Wexler and Clegg, 2002;
Fountoukis and Nenes, 2007) estimated the particle acidity and sulfate production during pollution episodes in China (Cheng et al., 2016; Guo et al., 2017; Liu et al., 2017). Those previous studies treated the PM exclusively as a mixture of inorganic salts dominated by ammonium sulfate and neglected the effects due to the presence of organic compounds. Apparently, the conclusions by those modeling studies hinge on the validity of several critical assumptions in their analyses, including the application of the thermodynamic model, the accuracy in determining the aerosol water content (AWC), and the applicability of the earlier experimental measurements for the aqueous oxidation of SO₂ by NO₂ to atmospheric conditions.

Estimation of the pH values using the thermodynamic models is typically of considerable uncertainty, because of several intricate difficulties. For example, the ISORRPIA-II model includes two modes, i.e., metastable (aerosols are assumed to be in the liquid-phase only and may reach supersaturation) and stable (aerosols are assumed in the liquid- and solid phases that are in equilibrium) (Guo et al., 2017). Since the thermodynamic model is established on the basis of the equilibrium principles, its application to non-equilibrium conditions needs to be rigorously assessed. Also, the phase (e.g., liquid, amorphorous, or crystalline) and mixing state of ambient aerosols are highly complex because of the presence of multi-component organic and inorganic species (Qiu and Zhang, 2013; Zhang et al., 2015), inevitably rendering high uncertainty in the thermodynamic calculations.

Guo et al. (2017) suggested that the pH predictions using the metastable mode would be more reliable than that using the stable mode, on the basis of model evaluation from measured and predicted NO₃⁻ and NH₄⁺ during the winter of 2012 in Xi’an. Figure 4 compares the concentrations of NH₃ (g) and aerosol species predicted by ISORROPIA-II with the field measurements under the metastable and stable modes in Xi’an during the winter of 2012. As
evident in Figure 4a and b, NH$_3$ predicted is similar to the measured value with the metastable or stable mode. Furthermore, the predicted concentrations of NO$_3^-$ and NH$_4^+$ using both the metastable and stable modes are nearly identical (Fig. 4c-f). Guo et al. (2017) only compared the liquid NH$_4^+$ and NO$_3^-$ predicted by the model under the stable mode with the field measured aerosols composed of both liquid and solid compounds, and thus their predicted concentrations were lower than those of the measurements (see Figure S1 in Guo et al, 2017). As a result, their statement that pH prediction with the metastable mode would be more reliable than that with the stable mode was unjustified. Noticeably, the pH values estimated by the ISORROPIA-II model under the two modes are significantly different, with the values of 4.57±0.40 under the metastable mode and 6.96 ±1.33 under the stable mode. Most recently, it was suggested that the large discrepancy in predicting pH is attributable to the model code errors (Song et al., 2018).

In addition, the pH estimation by the thermodynamic model is highly dependent on the ratio of the concentration of hydrogen ions in the liquid-phase to AWC. Guo et al. (2017) and Liu et al. (2017) assumed negligible particle water associated with the organic aerosol mass. Such an assumption is clearly invalid since aerosols typically contain a large portion of WSOM in China (Fig. 3), including organic nitrogen species (Wang et al., 2010, 2013) and acids (Wang et al., 2006, 2009, 2010). Also, organic acids engage in particle-phase reactions with the basic species (i.e., NH$_3$ and amines), significantly enhancing the particle hygroscopicity and reducing the acidity (Gomez-Hernandez et al., 2016). In addition, because of their strong basicity and high abundance, amines likely play a key role in reducing the particle-acidity in China (Wang et al., 2010a, b; Qiu et al., 2011; Qiu and Zhang, 2012; Dong et al., 2013; Zheng et al., 2015; Yao et al., 2016; Liu et al., 2017). Consequently, the acidity for organics-dominated aerosols is considerably different from that of ammonium sulfate aerosols, as demonstrated in our
experimental results. While effort has been made to account for the effects of organic species on the aerosol properties (Clegg et al., 2013), the available thermodynamic models are still inadequate in representing complex multi-component aerosols. An inconsistency of the ammonium–sulfate ratios using the thermodynamic models was identified in the eastern US, also suggesting a possible role for organic species (Silvern et al., 2017).

Furthermore, the chemical mechanism leading to the aqueous conversion of SO$_2$ to sulfate by NO$_2$ is not well understood. The previous modeling studies adopted the aqueous reaction rate constants previously measured (Lee and Schwartz, 1983; Clifton et al., 1988), while the applicability of the earlier experimental studies to atmospheric conditions is uncertain. For example, Lee and Schwartz (1983) examined the oxidation of S(IV) by NO$_2$ in the liquid phase by flowing gaseous NO$_2$ through a NaHSO$_3$ solution at a constant pH by regulating NaOH and determined the rate constant of $1.4 \times 10^5$ M$^{-1}$ s$^{-1}$ at pH = 5 and with a lower limit of $2 \times 10^6$ M$^{-1}$ s$^{-1}$ at pH = 5.8 and 6.4 from measuring the electrical conductivity of the solution. Clifton et al. (1988) measured the rate constant for the reaction of NO$_2$ with S(IV) over the pH range of 5.3-13, by producing NO$_2$ from irradiation of NaNO$_2$ and N$_2$O solutions and mixing with Na$_2$SO$_3$ solutions, and obtained the second-order rate constant of $1.24 \times 10^7$ and $2.95 \times 10^7$ M$^{-1}$ s$^{-1}$ from the decay of NO$_2$ monitored by absorption spectroscopy. The results of the measured rate constants between the two earlier experimental measurements differed by 1-2 orders of magnitude (Lee and Schwartz, 1983; Clifton et al., 1988). Also, both kinetic experiments employed bulk solutions and did not account for the gaseous uptake process (Lee and Schwartz, 1983; Clifton et al., 1988).

Wang et al. (2016) obtained the SO$_2$ uptake coefficient for sulfate production from combined field measurements and laboratory experiments, and their laboratory experiments
using aqueous oxalic acid particles reproduced the rapid sulfate production measured under polluted ambient conditions in China. The SO$_2$ uptake coefficient on oxalic acid particles in the laboratory reaction chamber is 8.3±5.7x10$^{-5}$ (Wang et al., 2016) under the humid conditions and similar to that (4.5±1.1 x 10$^{-5}$) (Wang et al., 2016) observed in Beijing during the haze period of 2015. The results of the SO$_2$ uptake coefficients determined by Wang et al. (2016) are also consistent with the modeling studies in quantification of the sulfate formation using atmospheric models in the country (e.g., Wang et al., 2014), indicating the applicability of their proposed mechanism to haze conditions in China. On the other hand, Liu et al. (2017) invoked the experimental work by Hung et al. (2015) as a plausible cause for rapid SO$_2$ oxidation by O$_2$ in the absence of photochemistry, but without noting the high acidity as a necessary condition in that experimental work (i.e., pH $\leq$ 3). Most recently, Li et al. (2018) suggested an indirect mechanism of SO$_2$ oxidation by NO$_2$ via HONO/NO$_2^-$ produced in fast-hydrolytic disproportionation of NO$_2$ on the surface of NaHSO$_3$ aqueous microjets. In addition, another recent theoretical work by Zhang et al. (2018) indicated that under weakly acidic and neutral conditions (pH $\leq$ 7) the oxidation of HOSO$_2^-$ by dissolved NO$_2$ is a self-sustaining process, where the produced cis-HONO, HSO$_4^-$ and H$_2$SO$_4$ promote the tautomerization from HSO$_3^-$ to HOSO$_2^-$ as the catalysts.

5. Conclusions

In this paper we have presented experimental measurements of the growth of ammonium sulfate seed particles exposed to vapors of SO$_2$, NO$_2$, and NH$_3$ at variable RH, the HGF of oxalic acid particles, and field measurements of WSOM for PM$_{2.5}$ during the severe haze events in Beijing, Hebei Province, and Xi’an of China. Our experimental results reveal that sulfate production on fine particles is dependent on the particle hygroscopicity, phase-state, and acidity,
as well as RH. The acidity and sulfate formation for ammonium sulfate seed particles are distinct from those of oxalic acid seed particles. Aqueous ammonium sulfate particles show negligible growth because of low pH, in contrast to aqueous oxalic acid particles with significant dry-size increase and sulfate formation because of high pH. In addition, our atmospheric measurements show significant concentrations of WSOM (including oxalic acid) in fine PM, indicating multi-component haze particles in China. Our results reveal that a particle mixture of inorganic salts adopted by the previous studies using the thermodynamic model does not represent a suitable model system and that the particle acidity and aqueous sulfate formation rate cannot be reliably inferred without accounting for the effects of multi-chemical compositions during severe haze events in China. Our combined experimental and field measurements corroborate the earlier finding that sulfate production via the particle-phase reaction involving SO₂ and NO₂ with NH₃ neutralization occurs efficiently on organics-dominated aerosols (Wang et al., 2016) but are in contradiction to the most recent studies using the thermodynamic model (Guo et al., 2017; Liu et al., 2017).

In conclusion, while the particle acidity or pH cannot be accurately determined from atmospheric field measurements or calculated using the thermodynamic models, our combined experimental and field results provide the compelling evidence that the pH value of ambient organics-dominated particles is sufficiently high to promote SO₂ oxidation by NO₂ with NH₃ neutralization under polluted conditions in China.

Acknowledgements

Financial support for this work was provided by National Key R&D Plan (Quantitative Relationship and Regulation Principle between Regional Oxidation Capacity of Atmospheric and Air Quality (No. 2017YFC0210000), the China National Natural Science Funds for
Distinguished Young Scholars (No.41325014), the program from National Nature Science Foundation of China (No. 41773117). This work was also supported by the Robert A. Welch Foundation (Grant A-1417). W.M.-O. was supported by the National Science Foundation Graduate Research Fellowship Program.
References

Cheng, C., Wang, G., Zhou, B., Meng, J., Li, J., Cao, J., and Xiao, S.: Comparison of dicarboxylic acids and related compounds in aerosol samples collected in Xi'an, China during haze and clean periods, Atmospheric Environment, 81(0), 443-449, 2013.


Clifton, C. L., Altstein, N., and Huie, R. E.: Rate constant for the reaction of nitrogen dioxide with sulfur(IV) over the pH range 5.3-13, Environmental Science & Technology, 22, 586-589, 1988.


Fountoukis, C., and Nenes, A.: ISORROPIA II: A computationally efficient thermodynamic equilibrium model for $K^+\cdotCa^{2+}\cdotMg^{2+}\cdotNH_4^+\cdotNa^+\cdotSO_4^{2-}\cdotNO_3^-\cdotCl^-\cdotH_2O$ aerosols, Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics, 7, 4639-4659, 2007.


Lee, Y. N., and Schwartz, S. E.: Kinetics of oxidation of aqueous sulfur (IV) by nitrogen
dioxide, in Precipitation scavenging, dry deposition, and resuspension, edited by H. R.
Identification of chemical compositions and sources of atmospheric aerosols in Xi'an, inland
China during two types of haze events, Science of the Total Environment, 566-567, 230-237,
2016.
Li, L., Hoffmann, M. R., and Colussi, A. J.: The role of nitrogen dioxide in the production of
sulfate during Chinese haze-aerosol episodes, Environmental Science & Technology 52,
DOI: 10.1021/acs.est.7b05222, 2018.
G.: Concentration, size distribution and dry deposition of amines in atmospheric particles of
Fine particle pH during severe haze episodes in Northern China, Geophysical Research
Meng, J., Wang, G., Li, J., Cheng, C., Ren, Y., Huang, Y., Cheng, Y., Cao, J., and Zhang, T.:
Seasonal characteristics of oxalic acid and related SOA in the free troposphere of Mt. Hua,
central China: Implications for sources and formation mechanisms, Science of the Total
aerosol particles interacting with water vapor: conceptual framework and experimental
evidence for restructuring, phase transitions and kinetic limitations, Atmospheric Chemistry
and Physics, 9, 9491-9522, 2009.
Pagels, J., McMurry, P. H., Khalizov, A. F., and Zhang, R.: Processing of soot by controlled
sulphuric acid and water condensation—Mass and mobility relationship, Aerosol Science &
enhanced absorption and direct radiative forcing of black carbon under polluted urban
environments, Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of
America, 113, 4266-4271, 2016.
Peng, C., Chan, M. N., and Chan, C. K.: The hygroscopic properties of dicarboxylic and
multifunctional acids: measurements and UNIFAC predictions, Environmental Science &
Prenni, A. J., DeMott, P. J., Kreidenweis, S. M., Sherman, D. E., Russell, L. M., and Ming, Y.:
The effects of low molecular weight dicarboxylic acids on cloud formation, Journal of
Qiu, Q., Wang, L., Lal, V., Khalizov, A. F., and Zhang, R.: Heterogeneous chemistry of
Alkylamines on Ammonium Sulfate and Ammonium Bisulfate, Environmental Science &
Technology, 45, 4748-4755, 2011.
Qiu, C., and Zhang, R.: Physiochemical Properties of Alkylaminium Sulfates: Hygroscopicity,
Qiu, C., and Zhang, R. Y.: Multiphase chemistry of atmospheric amines, Physical Chemistry
Chemical Physics, 15(16), 5738-5752, 2013.
Seinfeld, J. H., and Pandis, S. N., Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics: From Air Pollution to


Figure 1. Size evolution of ammonium sulfate (circle dots) and oxalic acid (black triangles) particles after exposure to SO₂, NO₂, and NH₃ at different RH levels. Variations in mobility diameter ($D_p$) of the particles as a function of reaction time. The symbols with different colors denote measurements with exposure to different SO₂, NO₂ and NH₃ concentrations and RH levels. For the ammonium sulfate particles exposure experiment, two levels of SO₂ were used, which are 37.5 ppb and 375 ppb, respectively, while the NO₂ concentration is 375 ppb, and the NH₃ concentration is 500 ppb. For the oxalic acid particles exposure experiment, the SO₂ concentration is 250 ppb, the NO₂ concentration is 250 ppb, and the NH₃ concentration is 1 ppm (The data of oxalic acid growth are cited from the previous study by Wang et al (2016)).
Figure 2. Measured hygroscopic growth factor (HGF) of oxalic acid particles at different RH conditions. $D_p$ is the particle diameter at an elevated RH, and $D_0$ (100nm) is the initial diameter of oxalic acid particles at RH = 8%.
Figure 3. Measurements of water-soluble organic matter (WSOM) of PM$_{2.5}$ collected in Beijing and Hebei Province during the winter of 2016 (left panels: a, c,e and g) and in Xi’an during the winter of 2012 (right panels: b, d, f and h). In (a) and (b), the green, red, blue, yellow, pink, and gray colors represent WSOM, sulfate, nitrate, ammonium, chloride, and the others (i.e., the sum of Na$^+$ + Ca$^{2+}$ + Mg$^{2+}$ + K$^+$), respectively.
Figure 4. Comparison of measured NH$_3$, NH$_4^+$, and NO$_3^-$ concentrations with those predicted by ISORROPIA-II model using the forward mode under the metastable (left panels) and stable assumptions (right panels).