Interactive comment on “Cloud thermodynamic phase and particle size estimation using the 0.67 and 1.6 \( \mu \)m channels from meteorological satellites” by D. Jolivet and A. J. Feijt

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 7 October 2003

The paper is devoted to the estimation of the particle size/phase from the top-of atmosphere reflectance, using 0.67 and 1.6 \( \mu \)m channels. The work is well presented. However, I have a feeling that the paper does not meet strict criteria of the ACP in respect to the scientific significance. Indeed, the method itself has been known. The authors also state this. The application of a well-known technique to satellite data does not make a significant contribution on its own. Therefore, I propose to select another journal for this publication.