
Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Ice nucleation terminology” by G. Vali et al.

G. Vali et al.

vali@uwyo.edu

Received and published: 18 June 2015

[acp, ms]copernicus

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

Reply to A. Bogdan.

G. Vali, P.J. DeMott, O. Möhler, T.F. Whale.

18 June 2015

[Interactive
Comment](#)

1.1 Appreciate the correction of an error that somehow remained unnoticed throughout previous iterations of this paper.

1.3 The word "germ" has been used in the literature for a very long time. Its meaning in terms of nucleation is clear from the broader, dictionary, meaning which refers to something capable of developing into more of the same. No further clarification is needed, but 'embryo' is indicated as the preferred alternative.

2.1.1 The difficulty here is the lack of firm evidence for the details of how ice first forms (nucleates) from the vapor. The terminology attempts to reflect current knowledge and to facilitate further discoveries by some flexibility in the definitions. The evidence we refer to is detailed in refereed articles; we cite one where further references can be found.

3.7 As we acknowledged in the previous reply, there is indeed a parallel use of the same phrase in reference to two different phenomena. The context is sufficiently distinct in the two cases that there is little danger of misunderstandings. This situations seems to

C13345

[Full Screen / Esc](#)

[Printer-friendly Version](#)

[Interactive Discussion](#)

[Discussion Paper](#)



us preferable to the introduction of new terms that override already established usage.

3.10 The focus of the terminology is the nucleation of ice. Other phenomena associated with growth of ice following nucleation are not within the purview of this paper.

ACPD

14, C13344–C13346,
2015

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C13346

