Interactive comment on “Comment on “Global risk of radioactive fallout after major nuclear reactor accidents” by J. Lelieveld et al. (2012)” by J. Lelieveld et al.

J. Lelieveld et al.
jos.lelieveld@mpic.de
Received and published: 14 October 2012

We thank Dr. Ehlermann for his comment.

We do not agree that the section “Phase-out of NPPs in Germany” is of political nature and that our statements were false. We also do not understand this repeated accusation. The only statement related to governmental policy which we made was “In the wake of the events in Fukushima the German government has decided to phase out all nuclear power plants over the next decade (in accord with the theory that large-impact and rare events are leading causes of societal change; see Taleb, 2010).” The first part of this statement is a simple fact: in the period of a few months after Fukushima this decision was reached by the German government, with a clear attribution to the Fukushima disaster for initiating this parliamentary discussion (the second part of our statement). Nowhere do we mention partisan politics, which parties were involved in this decision, or the history of the debate around nuclear power prior to this decision. It is our opinion that such partisan political discussions are not appropriate for ACP(D).

Our statement is only a brief introduction to the motivation for this section, for readers who are unfamiliar with the decision of the German government. Given that the decision itself is documented and publically known, it is scientifically viable to simulate the consequences of this decision by determining what differences in risk can be expected if the reactors are eventually all shut down.