Interactive comment on “Analysis of secondary organic aerosol formation and aging using positive matrix factorization of high-resolution aerosol mass spectra: application to the dodecane low-NOx system” by J. S. Craven et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 4 October 2012

Overall: The presented manuscript describes the application of positive matrix factorization to high resolution - AMS data for an SOA experiment involving dodecane and OH radicals. The results include the findings of 3 factors that are assigned to the gas-phase partitioning of initial oxidation products, particle phase oxidation, and partitioning of the extended oxidation products. The results are very interesting but lack molecular level detail which is disappointing since the authors used a chemical ionization mass spectrometer with high resolution.

Comments: The composition of the factors 1-3 are not described. Thus, it’s very
difficult to conservatively interpret the meaning of the factors. Â¢ What is meant by
elemental analysis, do the authors refer to elemental ratios O/C and H/C or rather
the fragment ion elemental compositions CcHhOo? Â¢ Interestingly, the AMS com-
community has adapted the van Krevelen diagram for bulk characterization of the mass
spectra by plotting O/C and H/C which are determined from just a few characteris-
tic fragmentation ions. However the van Krevelen diagram (van Krevelen, 1963) was
designed to elucidate the elemental compositions of many individual molecular for-
ma. Since the authors write, “Elemental analysis of the PMF factor mass spectral
profiles elucidates the combinations of functionality that contribute to the slope on the
Van Krevelen diagram” it would be helpful to show the detected fragment ions repre-
senting each factor in a van Krevelen diagram at a few specific points over the ex-
periment. Â¢ The motivation for the current work – a study of alkane oxidation – is
based on a description of UCM from GC/MS methods from more than 10 years ago.
What is the evidence of alkane components; does this contradict the observations from
several recent papers which have referred to an aliphatic or terpenylic character in
ambient aerosol? Is the oxidation of alkanes suspected to be more significant than
terpenes as the source of aliphatic or terpenylic character. Â¢ Please provide at
least a short summary of the CIMS instrument and its general operation (St. Clair et
al., 2010; Paulot et al., 2009; Crounse et al., 2006). Â¢ Please detail the resolving
power with respect to a specific mass and provide the mass range of the observed
ions with chemical ionization. Examples of the well resolved molecular ions would
nicely complement this work. Â¢ PHA is an unnecessary acronym, potentially lead-
ing to confusion. Please write out peroxyhemiacetal formation. Â¢ The term amu
is not an SI unit for mass. It pertains to the mass scale where the mass of oxygen
was fixed to 16.000000. Please see “Units in Mass Spectrometry” by KENNETH
L. BUSCH (http://www2.chemistry.msu.edu/courses/cem832/units_of_mass.pdf). Â¢
The caption for Figure 4 appears to be incorrect, “…early C18 SOA formation.” Â¢
Seed particles were dried or wet? Â¢ What were the desired gas-phase concentra-
tions?
Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 12, 16647, 2012.