Interactive comment on “Evidence of an elevated source of nucleation based on model simulations and data from the NIFTy experiment” by P. Crippa et al.

K.E.J. Lehtinen
kari.lehtinen@uef.fi

Received and published: 10 May 2012

The conclusions of 'non-local nucleation' arising from analyzing figure 7, from the 'low ratio of 3nm to 6nm particle number concentrations' (Discussion, p. 11996, line 5) and 'the presence of a closed contour line around the highest number concentrations' (caption of fig. 7) may be wrong. As the contour plot in figure 7 is expressed as dN/d(logDp) (which is equal to Dp*dN/dDp), the phenomenon seen in the figure (the reddest colour is not at 3 nm but at somewhat larger sizes) is actually expected for an aerosol growing by condensation, see e.g. Lehtinen and Kulmala (ACP 3, 251-257, 2003).
We also would like to point out that Laaksonen et al. (ACP 8, 2657-2665, 2008) made aircraft measurements during a nucleation event in Hyytiälä and showed that the event started at the surface and evolved with the evolving boundary layer.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 12, 11979, 2012.