Interactive comment on “Relationship between particulate matter and childhood asthma – basis of a future warning system for Central Phoenix” by R. Dimitrova et al.

J. Lozovatsky
j.lozovatsky@gmail.com
Received and published: 16 November 2011

Thanks for clarifying the “linear regression” approach that has been/ has not been used in your study.

Now, when you addressed my attention to Fig. 5, I’d like to make one more comment. Although there are only 4 points in this plot without error bars, it is quite possible, I guess, that they may show not a linear trend, but an exponential growth of Y when X=PM10 increases from a threshold level of ~ 24 to about 60 mg/m3. Then the rate of increase is slowing down and Y approaches some level of saturation at high X. Of course, this is just a speculation, but for prediction purposes “my scenario” is qualitatively different compared to a continuous approximately linear dependence Y on X. Does it make any sense to you?