

Interactive comment on “Assessment of parameterizations of heterogeneous ice nucleation in cloud and climate models” by J. A. Curry and V. I. Khvorostyanov

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 31 March 2010

This paper assesses parameterizations of heterogeneous ice nucleation in cloud and climate models. Different approaches to parameterize heterogeneous ice nucleation exist, so that such an intercomparison paper is very valuable and I recommend publication. I am, however, concerned about the negative comments from those reviewers, whose parameterizations you criticize and who criticize your parameterization. I do not think that it is beneficial for the community if you fight a battle here. Therefore I recommend that you take their criticism into account and revise the paper in a way that they can accept your usage of their parameterizations. I also recommend that you include all parameterizations in figures 1- 6 instead of just choosing only one as that appears rather arbitrary. As that would increase the length of the paper, I suggest omitting those

C1146

figures and text that only show the KC parameterization such as figures 7&8. Otherwise you mix a further validation of the KC parameterization with an intercomparison and that overloads the papers.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 10, 2669, 2010.

C1147